

VILLAGE OF LOMBARD
INTER-DEPARTMENTAL REVIEW GROUP REPORT

TO: Lombard Plan Commission

HEARING DATE: March 21, 2005

FROM: Department of Community
Development

PREPARED BY: William Heniff, AICP
Senior Planner

TITLE

PC 05-06; 210, 214, 215, 224 and 228 S. Lincoln Street & 205 W. Maple Street (St. John's Evangelical Lutheran Church & School): The petitioner requests that the Village take the following actions on the property located within the R2 Single Family Residence District:

1. Amend the Comprehensive Plan to designate the lots at 210, 214, 224 and 228 S. Lincoln Street and 205 W. Maple Street as Public and Institutional Use.
2. Approve an amendment to Ordinance 1816 granting approval of a conditional use for a noncommercial recreational building/community center.
3. Approve an amendment to Ordinances 4363 and 4363A granting approval of a conditional use for a religious institution and for a private elementary school.
4. Approve a conditional use for a planned development for all of the subject properties, with the following deviations and variations from the Zoning Ordinance, as follows:
 - a. A variation from Section 155.508 (C)(6)(a) and a deviation from Section 155.406 (F)(1) to allow for a front yard setback of eighteen feet (18') where thirty feet (30') is required;
 - b. A deviation from Section 155.406 (F)(2) to allow for a corner side yard setback of one foot (1') where twenty feet (20') is required;
 - c. A deviation from Section 155.406 (G) to allow for a building height of up to thirty-five feet (35') from grade, where thirty feet (30') maximum height is allowed by right;
 - d. A variation from Section 155.404 (H) and Section 155.508 (C) (7), reducing the minimum required open space below the minimum 75 percent requirement;
 - e. A variation from Sections 155.708 and 155.709 reducing the requisite foundation and perimeter lot landscaping along the corner side yard; and
 - f. A variation from Section 155.602 (C), Table 6.3 reducing the number of requisite parking spaces.

GENERAL INFORMATION

Petitioner/Owner: St. John's Evangelical Lutheran Church / School
215 South Lincoln Avenue
Lombard, IL 60148

PROPERTY INFORMATION

Existing Zoning: R2 Single-Family Residence District

Existing Land Use: East side of Lincoln: Religious and Educational Institutions
West side of Lincoln: 1 single family residence, 3 vacant lot, 1 Senior/Recreation Center

Size of Property: East side of Lincoln: Approximately 1.97 acres
West side of Lincoln: Approximately 0.70 acres

Comprehensive Plan: East side of Lincoln: Recommends Public and Institutional
West side of Lincoln: Recommends Single-Family Residential Development

Surrounding Zoning and Land Use:

North: R2 Single-Family Residence District; developed as single-family residences and CRPD Conservation / Recreation District Planned Development; developed as the Helen Plum Library

South: R5 General Residence District; developed as multiple family residences and R2 Single-Family Residence District; developed as single-family residences

East: R2 Single-Family Residence District; developed as a Religious Institution (Calvary Episcopal Church)

West: R2 Single-Family Residence District; developed as a single-family residences

ANALYSIS

SUBMITTALS

This report is based on the following documents, which were filed with the Department of Community Development on March 1, 2005 and included within the petitioner's application packet:

1. Petition for Public Hearing
2. Application packet, prepared by Legat Architects (unless otherwise noted), dated February, 2005 and includes the following items:
 - a. Response to standards
 - b. Project design narrative
 - c. Response to Plan Commission workshop discussion
 - d. Plat of Survey/Topography, prepared by Ruettiger, Tonelli & Associates, Inc., dated October 18, 2004
 - e. Existing Campus Site Plan
 - f. Proposed Campus Site Plan
 - g. Stormwater Detention Plan
 - h. Proposed Elementary School Floor Plans
 - i. Proposed Elementary School Building Elevations
 - j. Proposed Landscape Plan
 - k. Existing and Proposed Traffic Flow Plan
 - l. Parking Spreadsheet

DESCRIPTION

The petitioner is proposing to build a new elementary school on the west side of Lincoln Avenue between Ash Street and Maple Avenue. The proposed school will replace the existing school building on the east side of Lincoln Avenue, immediately south of the existing church. The petition includes a number of requested zoning actions as set for in this report.

INTER-DEPARTMENTAL REVIEW REPORT

ENGINEERING

1. The stormwater outlet control structure shall be located on private property and not in the public right-of-way.

2. The structure, which the proposed out fall is tied into, shall be a catch basin. If the existing structure is an inlet than it shall be replaced with a catch basin.
3. The single-family residence to the south along Ash Street shall not be affected by increased stormwater runoff. Swales shall be installed to divert the emergency overland overflow to the right-of-way from the location of the stormwater detention vault.
4. A drainage and detention easement shall be granted over the stormwater vault and storm sewers.
5. Lincoln and Ash Streets have recently been reconstructed by the Public Works Department (summer of 2001) any utility cuts into the street shall incur a penalty per the Village of Lombard Code of Ordinances.
6. The proposed student drop-off location could cause a restriction in the traffic flow along Lincoln. The possibility of a pull off the street drop-off area on both side of Lincoln St. should be looked at. At a minimum a detailed traffic study should be completed. *(This issue is further reviewed within the KLOA traffic report)*

FIRE

The Bureau of Inspectional Services states the following:

1. The building to be designed for Type 1A or 1B construction and be fully sprinklered.
2. An outside-access only, first floor sprinkler /alarm room be provided.
3. The elevator(s) be designed to accommodate a full size stretcher in the horizontal position.
4. All handicap requirements and areas of refuge must be addressed.
5. Any dumpster enclosures near the building must be of non-combustible materials.

PLANNING

Full description of the petitioner's request is included within the petitioner's submittal packet. The IDRC report will focus upon the specific actions included within the petition.

Compliance with the Comprehensive Plan

The Comprehensive Plan is an advisory and visionary document that identifies appropriate land uses and policies. The properties on the east side of Lincoln are designated within the 1999 Comprehensive Plan for public and institutional uses. The west side of the property is designated for low density residential uses. This designation reflected the existing uses on the properties at the time the Plan was adopted. Staff included this amendment with the petition to address the pending petition – if the Board finds that the petition is acceptable, the Plan would be amended accordingly.

Compliance with the Zoning Ordinance

Zoning History

The following actions were taken on the property in the past:

- ZBA petition approved August 17, 1962 – granted approval of variations to building setback requirements, building height requirements and parking requirements for the purpose of constructing a new church (*the existing church on the premises*)
- Ordinance 1816 approved August 1, 1974 – approved a special use (conditional use) for a noncommercial recreational building/community center (Senior Center).
- Ordinance 3594 approved September 3, 1992 – approved a sign variation for two temporary signs for twelve months.
- Ordinance 4363 and 4363 approved September 18, 1997 granting approval of a conditional use for a religious institution and for a private elementary school (with companion variations).
- BOT 98-04 petition to vary parking design construction standards. Petition denied.

The subject property is zoned R2 Single-Family Residence District which generally allows single-family developments by right. The Ordinance designates religious institutions and elementary schools as conditional uses, which require a public hearing and Board approval prior to operating such uses.

The aforementioned actions approved by the Village pertain to the property on the east side of Lincoln Avenue. This petition will include the existing property as well as the new properties being added to the overall St John's campus.

Staff's response to each of the items included within the petition is noted below:

- *Approve an amendment to Ordinance 1816 granting approval of a conditional use for a noncommercial recreational building/community center.*

This amendment is included in the petition to address the proposed access driveway located on the recreation center property. The driveway is intended to provide rear access to the school for selected deliveries and for emergency access purposes. The drive will be placed in the same location as the existing driveway, the existing garage on the premises will be razed and the new drive will extend the full length of the property. Staff does not object to the additional access point to the school provided that parking prohibitions be placed on the driveway.

- *Approve an amendment to Ordinances 4363 and 4363A granting approval of a conditional use for a religious institution and for a private elementary school.*

These amendments provided for the school and church at their existing location. The amendment is included to address the additional properties on the west side of Lincoln.

By definition, conditional uses are intended to provide a way to review site specific components of each proposed use – their location on a property may or may not be appropriate at a given location. Comments regarding the appropriateness of the school at the location is provided for in the details noted below:

- *Approve a conditional use for a planned development for all of the subject properties, with the following deviations and variations from the Zoning Ordinance*

The intent of planned developments is defined as:

PLANNED DEVELOPMENT is a parcel of land or contiguous parcels of land of a size sufficient to create its own environment, controlled by a single landowner or by a group of landowners in common agreement as to control, to be developed as a single entity, the environment of which is compatible with adjacent parcels, and the intent of the zoning district or districts in which it is located; the developer or developers may be granted relief from specific land-use regulations and design standards and may be awarded certain premiums in return for assurances of an overall quality of development, including any specific features which will be of exceptional benefit to the community as a whole.

Staff presented the concept to the Plan Commission at a February, 2005 workshop session. The Commissioners concurred with staff's recommendation that all of St. John's properties should be reviewed in the context of a unified development. The planned development provisions relax the strict zoning regulations in the hope of achieving a better overall development.

- *A variation from Section 155.508 (C)(6)(a) and a deviation from Section 155.406 (F)(1) to allow for a front yard setback of eighteen feet (18') where thirty feet (30') is required*

For purposes of this development, Ash Street is considered the requisite front yard. The petitioner noted that the building was shifted to the south to provide greater building separation between the school and the senior center and between the school and the Maple Avenue residences. Should the Board choose not to grant this relief item, the petition will have to reduce the building by 12 feet, which would result in a space loss in their learning and computer centers and in two classrooms.

- *A deviation from Section 155.406 (F)(2) to allow for a corner side yard setback of one foot (1') where twenty feet (20') is required*

Lincoln Avenue is the corner side yard. In consideration of providing greater setbacks along the west side of the property (adjacent to the residences), staff suggested that the building be shifted as far east as practicable. As the property most affected by this request is the existing St. John's building itself, staff finds that this relief can be supported. However, to mitigate this issue, staff offers additional comments noted later in the report.

- *A deviation from Section 155.406 (G) to allow for a building height of up to thirty-five feet (35') from grade, where thirty feet (30') maximum height is allowed by right*

The petitioner is proposing a roof height of 33 feet above the proposed top of foundation. With the changes to the existing slope of the property, relief to provide for up to 35 feet is requested. The underlying R2 regulations permit structures of up to 30 feet by right and up to 45 feet via conditional use. The proposed deviation is requested to accommodate the proposed gymnasium that will be located roughly in the center of the building. To minimize the impact of the higher building, staff suggests that additional aesthetic building treatments should be provided as noted later in the report.

- *A variation from Section 155.404 (H) and Section 155.508 (C) (7), reducing the minimum required open space below the minimum 75 percent requirement*

The underlying R2 regulations require 50% open space for developments. The planned development standards require a 50% increase over the underlying district regulations.

To determine the appropriateness of this request, staff analyzed other religious institutions/schools in the Village for compliance with this provision. Additionally, staff also looked at zoning relief granted in the recent past for other religious institutions in the Village. As Appendix A shows, many existing institutions are within the 60 percent range of lot coverage. Since the Village has granted relief from this requirement for several other infill sites in the Village, staff can support this provision as well.

As noted on the site plan, stormwater will be accommodated by a vault system to be constructed below the proposed play area to the west of the building. Currently, no stormwater detention is provided for the site – stormwater either soaks into the ground or sheet drains onto adjacent properties. Therefore, even though a reduction in open space is sought by the petitioner, the detention requirements for the site will be met. However, to ensure that the entire site is not covered by impervious surfaces, staff recommends that the approval of this item be tied to the site plan and designate that the overall planned development shall provide at least thirty percent open space.

- *A variation from Sections 155.708 and 155.709 reducing the requisite foundation and perimeter lot landscaping along the corner side yard*

This request is a companion to the corner side yard deviation noted earlier. As the building is proposed to be located one foot off of the corner side yard, there will be no physical space to provide the requisite plantings. As the building setback relief, this request would be internal to the St. John's campus.

- A variation from Section 155.602 (C), Table 6.3 reducing the number of requisite parking spaces.

The property has 94 on-site spaces. While there are an additional 38 spaces within the adjacent public right-of-way, the Zoning Ordinance does not allow these spaces to be counted within their parking supply. The Zoning Ordinance considers each use within the overall development as a separate and distinct use for which parking would need to be provided. The existing parking lot serves both the church and school. However, primary parking demand on weekdays is generated from the school activities and not the church.

As noted in the previous zoning actions, parking relief has previously been granted for the development. With the addition of the new school (theoretically creating an increase in the number of required spaces), the previous zoning relief would need to be re-approved accordingly.

The petitioner notes that they have found that ample parking is available during school hours. Staff supports this contention, but notes that if the old school were to be used for active purposes, conflicts could occur. As such, staff recommends as a condition of approval that the use of old school building shall be used exclusively for the capital plant, ancillary congregation meeting rooms, and storage purposes only.

Compatibility with the Surrounding Land Uses

Surrounding uses to the west includes several single-family residences. The petitioner is proposing a solid fence along the west lot lines – a provision added to the plans at the recommendation of the Plan Commission.

To determine if the proposed use is compatible with the surrounding land uses and meets the standards for conditional uses, staff offers the following analysis of the subject property:

Traffic Analysis

The Village's traffic consultant KLOA reviewed the proposed development and visited the site to determine the impacts of the development. They have completed a report, which is also transmitted with the staff report. Simply stated, KLOA finds that the existing drop-off function

works well. They offer recommendations on the appropriate method for setting up the pedestrian crossing activities before and after school, as noted in the report.

As an aside, staff notes that the Police Department staff has not had any past problems with the stacking and queuing functions at the school. As Lincoln, Ash and Maple are public rights-of-way, the Village has the ability to monitor, enforce and amend parking provisions associated with these streets independently from the approval of the petition itself.

Building Elevations

The petitioner has submitted concept building elevational drawings. The exterior of the school will be primarily a pre-cast structure. As noted in the workshop session, staff recommends that additional masonry be added to the east building elevation. While the petitioner is concerned about the additional development costs, staff notes that substantial relief is being requested for the corner side yard. The addition of the masonry component will break up the bulk of the building and will improve compatibility with the adjacent neighborhood.

Vacation of Lincoln Avenue

The question of a possible vacation was discussed at the February Plan Commission meeting. Staff reviewed this issue and does not support such an action for the following uses:

1. The Village has existing water and sewer utility lines within the right-of-way;
2. There is a substantial width between Main and Elizabeth Streets. If a vacation was approved the block face would be 1420 feet, which exceeds the maximum block length standard established within Section 154.505 (B)(2) of the Subdivision and Development Ordinance.
3. The right-of-way provides an excellent direct pedestrian link from residential neighborhoods south of Ash to the Plum Library on Maple Street.

Compatibility with the Sign Ordinance

The petitioner will be installing a institutional wall sign to denote the school name to be placed on the retaining wall at the main entrance. The proposed sign meets the provisions enumerated within the Sign Ordinance.

Compatibility with the Subdivision and Development Ordinance

The properties west of Lincoln consist of several lots of record. The proposed buildings and parking lot would be constructed across existing lot lines. As a condition of approval, a Plat of Consolidation will be required that consolidates all of the lots on the west side of Lincoln owned by St. John's into a single lot of record. This plat can be approved administratively.

Additional Considerations

The petitioner noted in the workshop session that they conducted neighborhood meetings to discuss the proposal and represented to the Commissioners that the neighborhood conceptually supported the proposal. Included within this petition are additional correspondences staff has received relative to the design of the proposed school. Should the Plan Commission find that any of these additional concerns should be addressed, the Commissioner can either condition the approval to incorporate their requests or the petition may be continued in order to provide the Commissioners with additional details and or an amended plan.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

With the comments and recommendations noted within this staff report, the proposed conditional use for a planned development is compatible with the surrounding land uses and is in compliance with the Zoning Ordinance and the recommendation of the Comprehensive Plan, as amended.

Based on the above considerations, the Inter-Departmental Review Committee recommends that the Plan Commission make the following motion recommending approval of this petition subject to the conditions as outlined:

Based on the submitted petition and the testimony presented, the proposed conditional use and variations do comply with the standards required by the Lombard Zoning Ordinance and Subdivision and Development Ordinance; and, therefore, I move that the Plan Commission accept the findings of the Inter-departmental Review Report as the findings of the Plan Commission and therefore, I move that the Plan Commission recommend to the Corporate Authorities approval of the conditional use and variations associated with PC 05-06, subject to the following conditions:

1. The petitioner shall develop the site essentially in accordance with site plan prepared by Legat Architects, Inc., dated February, 2005 and made a part of this request, except where amended by the conditions of approval.
2. That upon the opening of the new school, the existing school building shall be used exclusively for capital plant, storage purposes, offices and/or meeting space. Should the petitioner or any subsequent property owners seek to operate uses such as, but not limited to, day care facilities, pre-school activities or elementary school activities within the old school building, a conditional use amendment will be required.
3. That the requisite open space shall be provided in accordance with the submitted site plan and that the open space within the overall planned development shall not be lower than 30% of the overall planned development area.

4. That the petitioner shall apply for and receive a building permit for the proposed improvements. Said permit shall also include the following elements:
 - a. That the petitioner shall also submit a revised landscape plan with the building permit application that will specifically denote the existing vegetation that will be preserved as part of the development as well as the additional plant materials proposed for the west side of the school property, consistent with Village Code.
 - b. That the petitioner shall also submit a photometric lighting plan for the property consistent with Village Code.
 - c. That the proposed trash enclosure shall be constructed of the same materials as the principal building and shall be designed consistent with Village Code.
 - d. That rooftop mechanical units shall be screened from adjacent residential properties.
 - e. That the petitioner shall satisfactorily address the comments included within the IDRC report.
 - f. That a Plat of Consolidation shall be submitted to the Village for review and approval consolidating the parcels on the west side of Lincoln owned by the petitioner into a single lot of record.
5. That the petitioner shall designate the following areas accordingly:
 - a. The proposed driveway located west of the recreation/senior center building shall be designated as a no parking lane.
 - b. The delivery/emergency access area shall be used for loading activities only and visitor parking shall not be allowed at this location.
6. That the site shall be constructed and operated in conformance with the Lombard Village Code.
7. That the east elevation of the school building shall be modified to include a brick/masonry component, with the design subject to the review and approval of the Director of Community Development.

Plan Commission
Re: PC 05-06
Page 12

Inter-Departmental Review Group Report Approved By:

David A. Hulseberg, AICP
Director of Community Development

DAH:WJH:

Att

c. Petitioner

Appendix A
Analysis of Lot Coverage for Existing Lots Improved with Religious Institutions/Schools

A review of Plan Commission and Zoning Board of Appeals cases has revealed a pattern with regard to the amount of lot coverage existing at churches that are located within residential districts. Lot coverage for many of these sites is between in the 60-70% range, even though the Zoning Ordinance permits no more than 50% lot coverage. Staff surveyed a number of church sites within established residential area; details of the researched properties are listed below.

Name	Address	District	Lot Size	Improvements	Lot Coverage
Lombard Gospel Chapel	369 N. Grace	R2	31, 280 sq. ft.	22,840 sq. ft.	73.0%
Apostolic Church of Jesus Christ	702 S. Grace	R2	11, 690 sq. ft.	7,600 sq. ft.	65.8%
Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints	405 S. Westmore	R4	20,000 sq. ft.	12,908 sq. ft.	64.5%
Calvary Episcopal Church	105 W. Maple	R2	67,208 sq. ft.	39,554 sq. ft.	63.6%
Holy Trinity Lutheran Church	350 E. Madison	R2	82,132 sq. ft.	50,562 sq. ft.	61.6%
Grace Baptist Church	1100 S. Fairfield	R2	34,336 sq. ft.	21,171 sq. ft.	61.6%
Berean Bible Students Church	535 E. Maple	R2	81,718 sq. ft.	50,202 sq. ft.	61.4%
St. Timothy Ev. Lutheran Church	547 N. Main	R2	106,562 sq. ft.	49,287 sq. ft.	46.3%
Assembly of God	447 W. North	R2	63,106 sq. ft.	22,189 sq. ft.	35.2%
St. Thomas Marthoma Church	710 N. Main St.	R2	Approx. 80,000 sq. ft.	53680 sq. ft.	32.9%
Lombard Mennonite Church	528 E. Madison	R2	109,984 sq. ft.	35,052 sq. ft.	31.9%

Staff notes that relief has been granted for a number of religious institutions/schools to either reduce the parking requirement or to allow for deviations from the open space requirement including Sacred Heart (Ordinance 4936) from 50 % to 12% and parking design reductions Lombard Bible Church (Ordinance 4613). Other religious institutions received variations for interior landscaping or setback provisions (former Lombard Church of the Nazarene, St. John’s Lutheran Church and First Church of Lombard). While each case is reviewed on its own merit, staff feels that a precedent has been established to grant variations or deviations for religious institutions/schools in order to provide for a better overall site plan that minimizes the impact on surrounding properties.